AGENDA
Historic Yorktown Design Committee
Regular Meeting (re-scheduled)
York Hall – East Room - 301 Main Street
March 23, 2005
7:00 PM

1. Call to Order

2. Roll Call

3. Approval of Minutes – January 19, 2005 meeting

4. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness
   - **Application No. HYDC 7-05: Fifes and Drums of York Town:** Request approval of design for proposed new building to be constructed at 202 Church Street and to serve as the new headquarters for the Fifes and Drums of York Town.

5. Old Business

6. New Business

7. Reports / Member Concerns

8. Adjourn

COUNTY OF YORK
MEMORANDUM

DATE: March 15, 2005 (HYDC Mtg. 3/23/05)

TO: Historic Yorktown Design Committee

FROM: J. Mark Carter, Assistant County Administrator

SUBJECT: Application No. HYDC-7-05: The Fifes and Drums of York Town – 202 Church Street

Issue

This application, submitted by Mr. Walt Akers, President of the Fifes and Drums of York Town, seeks approval for the design of a proposed building to be constructed on property located at 202 Church Street. The proposed structure will become the new headquarters for the Fifes and Drums Corps.

The proposed 1.5-story structure will contain approximately 3,000 square feet of office, rehearsal and storage space, all of which is needed to better accommodate the growing ranks of the Corps. The structure is proposed to be located on property being made available to the Corps under the terms of the land exchange agreement executed several years ago by the National Park Service and York County. The terms of that agreement specified that any proposed construction would be subject to architectural design review by the National Park Service and State Historic Preservation Office and that review process has been completed, as evidenced by the attached letter, dated January 28, 2005, from P. Daniel Smith to James O. McReynolds.

Copies of the applicant's explanation of the request and architectural drawings of the proposed structure are attached.

Pertinent Design Guidelines

The subject structure is located in the *Historic Core*, as defined by the Yorktown Historic District and Design Guidelines and should be evaluated for conformance with the standards for New Construction – Commercial, Civic and Institutional Construction (see standards beginning on page 45 of the Design Guidelines). A summary listing of those standards, along with staff comments regarding compliance, follows (comments in *italics* indicate items that require special attention/decisions by the HYDC):

Standard	Comments
Setback - The setback of commercial, civic and institutional buildings should be consistent and coordinated with the setback of surrounding structures and appropriate to their use, overall design and site development. In general, new commercial, civic or institutional buildings should not be constructed forward of existing buildings on either side.	The building is proposed to be located approximately 7 feet from the front property line along Church Street, making it consistent with the setbacks of nearby buildings along Main Street (Swan Tavern, Period Designs, Yorktown Shoppe).

Standard	Comments
Orientation of Primary Buildings - The main entrance façade of primary civic and institutional buildings should be oriented to the street on which they are located. In the case of structures located on corner or through lots, the primary structure may have its principal entrance façade oriented to either of the streets, except where one of the frontages is Main Street, in which case orientation should be to that street. Secondary buildings may orient to the primary building on the same lot or to an adjacent street.	The main entrance will face Church Street. Additional entrances will be located on the side and rear facades of the attached dependency.
Size and Scale - The maximum height above grade at the principal façade should not exceed two-and-a-half stories (exclusive of cupolas, steeples, etc.). The maximum allowable footprint (lot coverage) for primary and secondary buildings combined should not exceed 75% of the size of the subject lot.	The primary structure is one and one-half stories in height, while the attached dependency is one-story. The structure has a footprint of approximately 2,600 square feet, which represents a lot coverage ratio of approximately 30%.
Form and Massing - Structures should generally be designed with a rectangular form with necessary building floor area accommodated through a primary structural block and subordinate wings, rather than a single massive block of space and building elevation. Specifically not appropriate are round structures, geodesic domes or other unusual or uncharacteristic designs. Building form and massing must be designed with attention to compatibility with their immediate surroundings and the overall character of the entire village.	The primary structural block is rectangular in shape (55' x 29') with the long axis parallel to Church Street. The subordinate wing, located to the rear of the primary structure, is also rectangular in shape (31' x 23').
Roof Form - Roofs of all civic and institutional buildings should be visually prominent, and generally should use gabled or hipped roof forms. Depending on the presence and configuration of wings, the resulting roof may include more complex arrangements and intersections of the basic forms such as intersecting or clipped gables and variations of the standard hipped roof. Roof pitch should be in the range of 9:12 to 12:12.	The roofline incorporates a clipped gable design on both the primary and subordinate structure. The primary structure has five (5) dormers, all of which are aligned with first floor windows and the front door. The proposed roof pitch is 12:12.
Façade Arrangement - The principal façade should be organized symmetrically. Major institutional and civic buildings should have prominent entrances, articulated by architectural features such as porches, porticos, pediments, architraves or other prominent elements that are consistent with the overall building design.	The principal façade is symmetrical with its windows, dormer and front door arrangement. Although this structure will not be used for residential purposes, its design is consistent with residential structures and the nearby Swan Tavern. Hence, its entrance is not as prominent as might be appropriate with other non-residential structures.
Foundation Materials (a) Brick-faced foundations should be used for all commercial, civic and institutional buildings. (b) Foundations may be differentiated from the wall surface by the use of water tables, belt courses, or other similar brick features.	 The foundation will be brick-faced. Since the structure has more of a residential character, and since clapboard siding is proposed, the water table/belt course treatment does not seem essential
Standard	Comments

Standard	Comments
Wall Materials	
(a) Foundation and wall materials for additions should be compatible with those of the existing construction in type, color, texture, size, spacing, and general appearance.	
(b) Brick is an appropriate material for civic and institutional buildings.	Given the proximity to the Swan Tavern, the proposed clapboard siding appears to be suitable and appropriate.
(c) Virginia red brick is the preferred wall material for civic and institutional buildings; no old, variegated, mottled, or glazed bricks should be used. Variation in brick size and texture may be appropriate if integral to the overall design of the building.	The applicant's written narrative indicates that brick color will be red.
(d) Common and American bonds are appropriate; Flemish, English, and other period bonds are not.	Building plans specify a running bond for the brick-veneer foundation.
(e) Mortar should be in a beige-to-tan color range, and mortar joints should be struck with a grapevine profile.	*The plans do not specify mortar color or mortar joint treatment.*
(f) Although the use of stucco on Grace Church is both skillful and unique, stucco is not a traditional material in Yorktown and its use should not be encouraged.	N.A.
(g) Stone is an appropriate material if its use is compatible with and incidental to that of brick, such as for doorway surrounds, door and window lintels, or windowsills.	N.A.
(h) In addition to brick, painted wood clapboarding is an appropriate material for commercial structures and, on a case-by-case basis, institutional buildings. Composite wood products, and other wood substitute or synthetic sidings and trim may be used if they are indistinguishable in outward appearance and compatibility from an otherwise approvable standard wood product.	The building plans propose the use of Hardie Board siding (or equivalent), which is a cement-based composite siding that resembles wood clapboard. Plans indicate a six-inch exposure, which is consistent with typical siding patterns in Yorktown. This same type of siding was used on the Freeman residence and is indistinguishable in appearance from real wood clapboard. *Specific approval of this type of siding is required.* Siding on the dormers is proposed to be cedar.
Roof Materials	
Slate or wood shingles are the preferred materials for civic, institutional and commercial structures; however, asphalt and fiberglass composition shingles may be approved by the HYDC on a case-by-case basis.	Consistent with this standard, the roof is proposed to be a 40-year, dark slate grey architectural shingle. *Specific approval of composition shingles is required.*

Doors (a) Doors should be wood, raised-panel designs, with or without lights.	Six-panel entrance doors are proposed.
(b) If the principal façade has more than one entrance, the main entry for public access should be the most prominent.	The principal façade has only one entrance door.
(c) Entrance doors may be single or double in configuration based on their function and importance.	The entrance door is a single-configuration.
(d) Sliding glass doors should not be used on any elevation and glass doors of any type should be avoided unless they can fit into the design without adversely impacting the architectural character of the building.	There are no sliding glass doors.
(e) Exterior doors may either be painted or have a natural finish if the surface is smooth and of a suitable wood.	Exterior doors are proposed to be painted white.
(f) Steel or composite doors may be used provided they have the appearance of a wooden, raised-panel door.	Steel exterior doors are proposed.
(g) All attached hardware should be simple in design and appropriate to the character of the building and the district.	No hardware details are provided. *Compliance with this requirement should be a specific condition of approval.*
Windows	
(a) Windows should be double-hung, wood sash designs with a vertical proportion. Windows with an equivalent appearance and constructed of a composite or synthetic material or cladding may be considered on a case-by-case basis.	White, vinyl-clad, double-hung, vertical proportion (6-over-6 and 6-over-9) windows are proposed. *Specific approval is required for the vinyl cladding*.
(b) Window sash may have multiple panes created by fixed wood muntins; snap-in muntins giving a single, large pane the appearance of multiple lights are not preferred, but may be considered on a case by case basis.	Snap-in muntins are proposed. *Specific approval of the snap-in style is required.*
(c) The use of energy efficient windows is encouraged to eliminate the need for exterior storm windows.	Insulated windows are proposed.
(d) The majority of the windows on the principal façade should be uniform in size and regularly spaced. Other window designs may be acceptable if they are appropriate to the design of the building.	All first floor, front façade windows are the same size; all dormer windows are the same size.
Shutters Shutters should be constructed of wood or an equivalent composite or synthetic wood-like material, painted, and sized to fit the windows or doors they are intended to cover.	Shutters are shown on the architectural drawings but noted as "optional" in the applicant's narrative statement. Paint color is proposed to be dark green (*should be specified as Burdett's Ordinary Black Green or Market Square Tavern Dark Green*).
Standard	Comments

Porches, Stoops and Railings	
(a) Porches and stoops should be consistent and compatible in form with the principal block of the building.	All stoops appear to be compatible with the building design.
(b) Front porches and stoops should not be enclosed.	The front stoop is unenclosed/uncovered.
(c) All porch supports, columns and posts should be constructed of painted wood or wood-like synthetic or composite materials, or dressed stone and should be compatible with the overall design of the porch, building, and that of nearby properties.	N.A.
(d) Porch railings may be either painted wood or metal. Railings and balusters should employ square or turned pickets.	Handrails for the stoops are proposed to be black wrought iron. Handrails for the handicapped ramp will be black wrought iron according the applicant's narrative. Black tubular steel would be an acceptable substitute since the ramp will be hidden from view from Church Street.
(e) All porch roofs should be pitched or hipped and compatible with the roof form of the principal block.	N.A.
(f) All steps leading to porches and stoops should be of brick, slate, or painted wood or wood-like synthetic construction.	Steps and stoops are proposed to be brick veneer.
Chimneys	
(a) Brick should be used for all chimneys, whether internal or external.	N.A. (no chimneys)
(b) Articulation of the cap and variation in width from the firebox to the cap may be desirable in some instances.	
(c) The use of metal flue pipes/chimneys/vents should be limited to portions of the structure not visible from public street rights-of-way or other publicly accessible spaces (including the river). In any event, if metal flues or vents are used, they should be painted to match the color of the roof or wall through which they protrude.	

Standard	Comments
Gutters and Downspouts	
(a) The use of ground gutters is encouraged.	A French drain system is proposed around the building perimeter.
(b) If fascia-mounted guttering is used, it should be copper with a half-round configuration. Metal, painted to match the color of the eave fascia, of a half-round or such other style deemed appropriate to the style of the structure, may be considered on a case-by-case basis.	N.A. – no guttering is proposed
(c) Downspouts should be of a round cross-section or other shape appropriate to the style of the structure, and painted to match the color of the wall surface to which they are attached.	N.A.
Color	
(a) Paint colors for all exterior wood surfaces (excluding fences) associated with new construction should be comprised of a color or colors from the Yorktown Color Palette, as defined in Appendix 3, Glossary. Other colors may be proposed and will be considered on a case-by-case basis.	Siding, trim, windows and doors are proposed to be white; Shutter color (if shutters provided) to be dark green
(b) Unpainted brickwork on *pivotal* or *contributing* buildings shall not be painted.	N.A.
(c) All wood trim on brick buildings should be painted white or similar light neutral color compatible with the brick wall materials.	Trim to be white
Mechanical and Communications Equipment	
(a) Ground-level mechanical and communications equipment should be screened from view from public rights-of-way and other publicly-accessible spaces by walls of the same design and materials as the building, by appropriate plant materials, or a combination of the two.	Heat pump compressor units (3) are proposed to be located in the outdoor alcove area between the primary and subordinate structures and will not be visible from Church Street.
(b) Rooftop mechanical and communications equipment should be fully screened from view by locating such equipment in attics, cupolas or other familiar roof forms, or by screening it with continuous parapets that are integrated into the overall form of the roof.	N.A. – none proposed
Walls and Fences	
(a) Brick walls may be considered if they are essential for security, privacy, or screening, or are integral in establishing site definition or linkages with adjacent buildings and areas.	N.A. – none proposed
(b) The height of a brick wall should be appropriate to both its purpose and the design of adjacent buildings and landscapes.	N.A.
(c) Brick should comply with the requirements for building wall surfaces.	N.A.
(d) Metal fences of any kind, other than wrought iron, are not appropriate. Wood fences will be evaluated on a case-by-case basis.	N.A.
Standard	**Comments**
Walks, Paths and Paved Pedestrian Areas	

(a) Walks and paths providing access to and from the street and within the property where visible from public rights-of-way should follow rectilinear paths.	A concrete walkway will run from Church Street along the left side of the structure and around the back left corner of the main structure to provide access to the handicapped ramp. This ramp is required by the Building Code. It is in an inconspicuous, yet functional, location behind the building.
(b) Paved pedestrian areas that immediately abut the building should be provided only in association with the principal entry to the building.	
(c) Appropriate paving materials include paving brick compatible in color to that used for the building's exterior walls, or concrete with a brown or gray pea gravel exposed aggregate finish.	The building plans appear to indicate a smooth concrete finish. *Brown or gray exposed aggregate finish should be specified..*
(d) Asphalt is not an appropriate paving material for walks and paths.	N.A.
(e) All paving materials must comply with ADA accessibility standards.	*Exposed aggregate surface must meet ADA requirements*
<u>Vehicular Circulation and Parking Areas</u>	
(a) Parking areas should be designed to have minimal visual impact.	The building will depend on the public parking area located across Church Street.
(b) All parking areas should be visually buffered from public streets.	N.A.
(c) Wherever possible, parking requirements should be met through the shared use of existing parking areas.	Shared use is proposed.
(d) Driveways should not exceed twenty-four (24) feet in width.	N.A.
(e) New parking should be provided in small, well-defined areas, each not exceeding a capacity of thirty (30) vehicles, and separated and screened from view by such features as walls, plant materials, and buildings. Parking areas should include landscaped islands designed and located so as to break up large expanses of asphalt into bays with a capacity of approximately ten (10) vehicles each.	N.A.
(f) Parking areas should be located to the rear and sides of commercial, civic and institutional buildings, but never to the front or immediately abutting the building.	N.A.
(g) In cases where parking may need to be provided on an adjacent or nearby lot, the parking should have minimum setback of twenty (20) feet from the street right-of-way line.	N.A.
(h) Within the interior of parking areas, plant materials should be used to delineate vehicular and pedestrian circulation.	N.A.
Standard	Comments
Lighting	

(a) Landscape Lighting - Landscape lighting should be visually unobtrusive during both the day and night. It should complement the architecture and outdoor spaces rather than spot-lighting them. Lighting wattage should be understated and compatible with the setting and surroundings and must not create inappropriate light trespass onto adjacent properties or glare on adjacent properties, public streets or public areas.	N.A. - None proposed.
(b) Building Lighting - Building lighting should be provided only when it will enhance and complement the architectural features of a structure at night as opposed to spotlighting them for attention-getting purposes. Lighting wattage should be understated and compatible with the setting and surroundings and must not create inappropriate light trespass onto adjacent properties or glare onto adjacent properties, public streets or public areas.	According to the applicant's narrative, building lighting fixtures will be of a black, 18th century style consistent with the exterior fixtures used on nearby structures owned by the National Park Service. Several examples have been recommended by the NPS. *Use of these or equivalent fixtures should be specified.*
(c) Walkway and Parking Lot Lighting - Poles, posts and fixtures should be designed and sized as an integral part of the site architecture and, generally, should not exceed the height of the eaves of nearby structures. Galvanized metal, bright colors, and other visually inappropriate materials should not be used for poles, posts or fixtures. Lighting wattage should be selected and limited to achieve appropriate illumination levels for safety and security while avoiding light glare and trespass onto adjacent properties, public streets or public	N.A. – none proposed

Under Section 24.1-377(h), the following guidance is provided for the evaluation of applications proposing new construction:

(3) For new construction, the following shall apply:

a. The design for new construction shall be sensitive to and take into account the special characteristics that the district is established to protect. Such considerations are to include building scale, height, orientation, site coverage, spatial separation from other buildings, facade and window patterns, entrance and porch size and general design, materials, texture, color, architectural details, roof forms, emphasis of horizontal or vertical elements, walls, fences, and any other features deemed appropriate by the reviewing authority (Zoning Administrator or HYDC).

b. The design of the new construction shall recognize the relationships among buildings in the immediate setting rather than specific styles or details since architectural styles and details may throughout the Historic District.

Recommendation

The applicant has thoroughly coordinated the proposed building plans with the National Park Service and both the NPS and the State Historic Preservation Office have approved the proposed design. The building will be located on the property in a manner that respects and preserves several large mature trees and its design is compatible with the adjacent Swan Tavern and other buildings along historic Main Street. The proposed use of certain alternative materials (Hardie Board siding, vinyl-clad windows, etc.) is consistent with the terms of the Design Guidelines, as noted above. Staff believes that the proposed building will be visually appealing and certainly compatible with its

surroundings. Accordingly, it is recommended that the Committee find the proposal consistent with the Guidelines and that the application be approved, subject to the following conditions:

1. The building shall be constructed in accordance with the exterior features depicted on the architectural renderings dated January 1, 2005.

2. Foundation mortar shall be beige/tan in color and joints shall be struck with a grapevine profile.

3. The use of Hardie Board (or equivalent) composite siding, grey architectural composition shingles, and vinyl-clad double hung windows with snap-in muntins, as indicated on the building plans, is approved.

4. All door hardware shall be simple in design and appropriate to the character of the building and the district, and shall be subject to approval by the Zoning Administrator after consultation with the National Park Service.

5. Exterior light fixtures shall be black framed, 18th century style consistent with the recommended examples of fixtures provided by the National Park Service and shall be subject to approval by the Zoning Administrator after consultation with the National Park Service.

6. If installed, shutters shall be painted Burdett's Ordinary Black Green or Market Square Tavern Dark Green.

7. The concrete walkway leading to the handicapped ramp, and the ramp itself, shall be finished with a brown exposed aggregate surface conforming to all applicable ADA requirements.

jmc

Copy to: Walt Akers, President, Fifes and Drums of York Town
P. Daniel Smith, Superintendent, Colonial National Historical Park

Attachments
- Application, with attached building plans
- Letter dated January 28, 2005 from P. Daniel Smith to James O. McReynolds
- Specification sheets on light fixtures, as suggested by NPS
- Vicinity Map
- Site Plan


York Hall
Swan Tavern Antiques
Yorktown Shoppe
Proposed Location
Fifes and Drums of York Town
NPS Parking Lot